BOLOGNA PROCESS STOCKTAKING 2009

List of indicators

Degree system

1. Stage of implementation of the first and second cycle

2. Access to the next cycle

3. Implementation of national qualifications framework

National implementation of *Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the EHEA*

4. Stage of development of external quality assurance system

5. Level of student participation in quality assurance

6. Level of international participation in quality assurance

Recognition

7. Stage of implementation of diploma supplement

8. National implementation of the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention

9. Stage of implementation of ECTS

10. Recognition of prior learning

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR THE DEGREE SYSTEM

DEGREE SYSTEM	
1. Stage of implementation of the first and second cycle	
Green (5)	At least 90% of all[1]students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Light green (4)	70-89 % of all students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Yellow (3)	50-69 % of all students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Orange (2)	25-49 % of all students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles
Red (1)	Less than 25% of students are enrolled in a two-cycle degree system that is in accordance with the Bologna principles

DEGREE SYSTEM	
2. Access to the next cycle	
Green (5)	All first cycle qualifications give access[2] to several second cycle programmes and all second cycle qualifications give access to at least one third cycle programme without major transitional problems[3]
Light green (4)	All first cycle qualifications give access to at least one second cycle programme and all second cycle qualifications give access to at least one third cycle programme without major transitional problems
Yellow (3)	There are some (less than 25%) first cycle qualifications that do not give access to the second cycle and/or some second cycle qualifications that do not give access to the third cycle
Orange (2)	A significant number (25 - 50%) of first and/or second cycle qualifications do not give access to the next cycle
Red (1)	Most (more than 50%) first and/or second cycle qualifications do not give access to the next cycle OR there are no arrangements for access to the next cycle

---

[1] "All" = all students who could be involved in 2-cycle system i.e. NOT those in doctoral programmes and NOT those in short HE programmes
NB Students of ALL study fields are taken into account

[2] Access : the right of qualified candidates to apply and to be considered for admission (definition used in the Lisbon Recognition Convention)

[3] Compensatory measures required for students coming from another study field will not be counted as "major transitional problems"

	DEGREE SYSTEM

3. Implementation of national qualifications framework

Green (5)	A NQF[4] compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has been developed. The NQF: • includes generic descriptors for each cycle based on learning outcomes and competences • includes ECTS credit ranges in the first and second cycles • all necessary arrangements for implementing the framework are in place; AND National qualifications: • are visibly linked with learning outcomes • have been included in the NQF through a quality assurance procedure; AND The agreed self-certification procedure[5] -- with participation of international experts -- has been completed, including publication of a final report.
Light green (4)	A NQF compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has been developed and: • includes generic descriptors for each cycle based on learning outcomes and competences. • includes ECTS credit ranges in the first and second cycles • all necessary arrangements for implementing the framework are in place • implementation of the NQF has started • the agreed self-certification procedure has started
Yellow (3)	A proposal for a NQF compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has been discussed with all relevant stakeholders at the national level and • includes generic descriptors for each cycle based on learning outcomes and competences • includes ECTS credit ranges in the first and second cycles • a timetable for finalizing the NQF has been agreed but the necessary formal decisions for establishing the framework have not yet been taken
Orange (2)	A proposal for a NQF compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has been prepared and: • includes generic descriptors for each cycle based on learning outcomes and competences. • includes ECTS credit ranges in the first and second cycles • a timetable for consulting relevant stakeholders has been drawn up but the consultation process has not yet been completed
Red (1)	The development process leading to a NQF compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has been completed but no timetable for consultation or adoption has been established ***OR*** The development process leading to a NQF compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has been launched but has not been completed ***OR*** Work on the development process leading to a NQF compatible with the overarching framework of qualifications of the EHEA has not been launched or is at a preliminary or exploratory stage.

---

[4] National Qualifications framework
[5] http://www.bologna-bergen2005.no/Docs/00-Main_doc/050218_QF_EHEA.pdf

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR NATIONAL IMPLEMENTATION OF
STANDARDS AND GUIDELINES FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN THE EHEA

QUALITY ASSURANCE

4. Stage of development of external quality assurance system

Green (5)	A fully functioning external quality assurance system is in operation at national level and applies to all higher education (HE).[6] Evaluation of programmes or institutions includes four elements: - self-assessment report, - external review, - publication of results, - follow-up procedures[7] In addition, peer review of the national QA agency(ies) has been completed according to the *Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA*
Light green (4)	A fully functioning external quality assurance system is in operation at national level and applies to all HE. Evaluation of programmes or institutions includes four elements - self-assessment report, - external review, - publication of results, - follow-up procedures AND a date has been set for peer review of the national QA agency(ies) according to the *Standards and Guidelines for QA in the EHEA*
Yellow (3)	A quality assurance system is in operation at national level, but it does not apply to all HE. The quality assurance system includes at least **two** of the four elements: - self-assessment report, - external review, - publication of results, - follow-up procedures No date has yet been set for a peer review of the national QA agency(ies).
Orange (2)	Legislation or regulations on quality assurance of programmes or institutions, including at least the four above elements, have been prepared but are not implemented yet **OR** implementation of legislation or regulations has begun on a very limited scale
Red (1)	There are no regulations or legislation on evaluation of programmes or institutions that include at least the four above elements **OR** legislation or regulations are in the process of preparation

---

[6] Higher education: all types of courses of study, or sets of courses of study, training or training for research at the post secondary level which are recognized by the relevant authorities of a country as belonging to its higher education system (definition from the Lisbon Recognition Convention)

[7] **Follow-up procedures:** *Quality assurance processes which contain recommendations for action or which require a subsequent action plan, should have a predetermined follow-up procedure which is implemented consistently* (ESG standard 2.6).

QUALITY ASSURANCE

5. Level of student participation in Quality Assurance

Green (5)	In all quality assurance reviews, students participate at five levels: - in the governance of national bodies for QA - in external review of HEIs and/or programmes: either in expert teams, as observers in expert teams or at the decision making stage, - in consultation during external reviews - in internal QA processes - in preparation of self-assessment reports
Light green (4)	Students participate at **four** of the five above levels
Yellow (3)	Students participate at **three** of the five above levels
Orange (2)	Students participate at **two** of the five above levels
Red (1)	Students cannot participate or participate at only one level

QUALITY ASSURANCE

6. Level of international participation in Quality Assurance

Green (5)	In all cases, there is international participation at four levels: 1) within teams for external review of HEIs and/or programmes, as members or observers 2) national quality assurance agency membership of ENQA or other international quality assurance network/s 3) in the governance of national bodies for QA 4) in the external evaluation of national QA agencies
Light green (4)	International participation takes place at above levels: 1); 2) AND either 3) or 4)
Yellow (3)	International participation takes place at above levels 1) and 2)
Orange (2)	International participation takes place either at above level 1) or 2)
Red (1)	There is no international involvement **OR** Structures and arrangements for international participation are not yet clear

SCORECARD CRITERIA FOR RECOGNITION OF DEGREES AND STUDY PERIODS

RECOGNITION	
7. Stage of implementation of Diploma Supplement	
Green (5)	**Every graduate**[8] receives a Diploma Supplement in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format[9] and in a widely spoken European language - automatically - free of charge
Light green (4)	**Every graduate[8]** who requests it receives a Diploma Supplement in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language - free of charge
Yellow (3)	A DS in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language is issued to **some graduates** OR in **some programmes** free of charge
Orange (2)	A DS in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language is issued to **some graduates** OR in **some programmes** for a fee
Red (1)	Systematic issuing of DS in the EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and in a widely spoken European language has not yet started

---

[8] including doctoral graduates
[9] EU/CoE/UNESCO Diploma Supplement format and its explanatory note can be found at http://www.aic.lv/ace/ace_disk/Dipl_Sup/index.htm

	RECOGNITION
	8. National implementation of the principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention
Green (5)	The Lisbon Recognition Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with the legal framework of the Convention. The later Supplementary Documents[10] have been adopted in appropriate legislation and applied in practice, so that the **five** main principles are fulfilled and: - applicants have a right to fair assessment, - there is recognition if no substantial differences can be proven, - in cases of negative decisions the competent recognition authority demonstrates the existence of (a) substantial difference(s), - the country ensures that information on its institutions and their programmes is provided, - an ENIC has been established
Light green (4)	The Lisbon Recognition Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with the Convention but further amendments of legislation are needed to apply the principles of the Supplementary Documents[10] in practice.
Yellow (3)	The Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with **three or four** of the five abovementioned principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention.
Orange (2)	The Convention has been ratified and appropriate legislation complies with **one or two** of the five abovementioned principles of the Lisbon Recognition Convention.
Red (1)	The Convention has been ratified but appropriate legislation has **NOT** been reviewed against the legal framework of the Lisbon Convention or the Supplementary Documents[10]. **OR** The Convention has not been ratified

---

[10] Recommendation on the Criteria and Procedures for Recognition (2001), Recommendation on the Recognition of Joint Degrees (2004), Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education (2001) http://www.enic-naric.net/instruments.asp?display=legal_framework

	RECOGNITION
	9. Stage of implementation of ECTS
Green (5)	ECTS credits are allocated to all components of all HE programmes[11], enabling credit transfer and accumulation, AND ECTS credits are demonstrably linked with learning outcomes[12]
Light green (4)	ECTS credits are allocated to all components of more than 75% of HE programmes, enabling credit transfer and accumulation, AND ECTS credits are demonstrably linked with learning outcomes **OR** Credits are allocated to all components of all HE programmes[11] using a fully ECTS compatible credit system enabling credit transfer and accumulation[13]AND Credits are demonstrably linked with learning outcomes[12]
Yellow(3)	ECTS credits are allocated in 50-75% of all HE programmes[11], AND ECTS credits are demonstrably linked with learning outcomes **OR** ECTS credits are allocated to all components of more than 75% of HE programmes[11], enabling credit transfer and accumulation, but ECTS credits are not yet linked with learning outcomes
Orange (2)	ECTS credits are allocated in at least 49% of HE programmes **OR** A national credit system is used which is not fully compatible with ECTS
Red (1)	ECTS credits are allocated in less than 49% of HE programmes[11] **OR** ECTS is used in all programmes but only for credit transfer

---

[11] excluding doctoral programmes
[12] i.e. learning outcomes are formulated for all programme components and credits are allocated only when the stipulated learning outcomes are actually acquired
[13] A "translation" between the national system and ECTS must be provided in the national report.

	RECOGNITION
	10. Recognition of prior learning
Green (5)	There are procedures, guidelines or policy for assessment and recognition of prior learning as a basis for 1) access to higher education programmes, and 2) allocation of credit**s** towards a qualification and/or exemption from some programme requirements, AND these procedures are demonstrably applied in practice
Light green (4)	There are procedures, guidelines or policy for assessment of prior learning but they are demonstrably used in practice for only one of the abovementioned purposes
Yellow (3)	Procedures, national guidelines or policy for assessment of prior learning have been agreed or adopted and are awaiting implementation **OR** There are no specific procedures/national guidelines or policy for assessment of prior learning, but procedures for recognition of prior learning are demonstrably in operation at some higher education institutions or study programmes
Orange (2)	Implementation of recognition of prior learning is in a pilot phase at some higher education institutions **OR** Work at drawing up procedures/national guidelines or policy for recognition of prior learning has started
Red (1)	No procedures for recognition of prior learning are in place **EITHER** at the national **OR** at the institutional/programme level.